

## PRESENTERS

### **Richard Boast, Faculty of Law, Victoria University of Wellington**

Richard Boast is a professor of law at Victoria University and has a long-standing interest in legal issues relating to the foreshore and seabed. He represented a number of claimant groups in the Waitangi Tribunal's Foreshore and Seabed Inquiry held in early 2003. His textbook on the subject, *Foreshore and Seabed* (Lexis Nexis), was published in 2005. Professor Boast was one of the members of the review panel which reported on the former 2004 Act in 2009.

### **Robert Makgill, North South Environmental Law, Auckland**

Robert is a North South Environmental Law director. He is the firm's principal litigator and specialises in public, environmental and natural resource law. He has acted for a wide range of clients including listed companies, central government, local authorities, network utility operators and iwi. Robert was legal advisor to Local Government New Zealand (LGNZ) during the passage of the Marine and Coastal Area Bill 2010. His firm has advised LGNZ, and various regional councils, on a number of Treaty settlements. He was also legal counsel in the International Law of the Sea Tribunal's historic advisory opinion on deep sea mining the high seas. In 2005 Robert was awarded a doctoral scholarship at the Ghent School of Public International Law, Belgium. He is a Research Fellow with the Lincoln University Planning School and a Doctoral Researcher at the University of Ghent. Robert is chairperson of the Queenstown/Central Otago branch of the Resource Management Law Association and a member of the Environmental Law Committee of the New Zealand Law Society.

## **Acknowledgement**

Special thanks to Michael Mulheron, Tom Scott, Malcolm Evans, Allan Hawkey and Al Nisbet for allowing the publication of their political cartoons in this seminar booklet and include the same in the seminar presentation.

Robert would like to acknowledge Katia Fraser (North South Environmental Law), Dr Royden Somerville QC (Barrister), Dr Hamish Rennie (Lincoln University) and Charl Hirschfeld (Barrister) who he has variously worked with at different times on Treaty of Waitangi settlement matters. Their professional and academic input has been hugely helpful in shaping his own thinking in respect of the Coastal and Marine Area Act 2011.

*The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.*

# CONTENTS

## **THE EVOLUTION OF THE MARINE AND COASTAL AREA (TAKUTAI MOANA) ACT 2011 . 1**

1. INTRODUCTION AND SCOPE OF THIS PAPER .....	1
2. DEFINITIONAL PROBLEMS AND RELATIONSHIP WITH THE ‘QUEEN’S CHAIN’ .....	1
3. THE NGĀTI APA DECISION, 2003.....	3
4. WAITANGI TRIBUNAL REPORT 2004.....	6
5. WHAT COULD THE MĀORI LAND COURT HAVE ACTUALLY DONE? .....	8
6. THE FORESHORE AND SEABED ACT 2004 .....	11
7. FORESHORE AND SEABED AND THE RESOLUTION OF HISTORIC CLAIMS.....	16
8. MINISTERIAL REVIEW PANEL REPORT, 2009 .....	17
9. PURPOSE AND PRINCIPLES .....	20
10. THE VESTING PROVISIONS OF THE MCAA .....	21
11. CONCLUSIONS .....	24

## **FEELING LEFT OUT AT SEA? NAVIGATING NO OWNERSHIP, CUSTOMARY RIGHTS & RESOURCE MANAGEMENT ..... 27**

1. INTRODUCTION.....	27
2. EUROPEAN CULTURAL AND SPIRITUAL CONNECTION: A PERSONAL STORY.....	29
<i>Preamble and purpose</i> .....	30
3. THE EXTENT OF THE MARINE AND COASTAL AREA – A JURISDICTIONAL LACUNA? .....	32
4. STATUTORY REGIME FOR THE COMMONS.....	35
<i>Public property</i> .....	35
<i>Customary title</i> .....	37
<i>No ownership</i> .....	39
<i>Freedom of navigation and fishing</i> .....	42
<i>The right of public access to the coastal marine area</i> .....	42
5. RECOGNITION OF CUSTOMARY RIGHTS AND TITLE.....	44
<i>Different kinds of property rights and regulatory rights</i> .....	44
<i>Protected Customary Rights (PCR)</i> .....	45
<i>Customary Marine Title (CMT)</i> .....	46
6. IMPLICATIONS FOR RESOURCE MANAGEMENT DECISION MAKING .....	47
<i>PCR exemption from ss 9 to 17 RMA</i> .....	47
<i>CMT RMA permission rights</i> .....	48
<i>CMT planning documents – implications for regional planning documents</i> .....	49
<i>Commercial use of PCR and CMT</i> .....	51
7. IMPLICATIONS FOR OTHER COASTAL AREA USERS.....	53
<i>Impact on resource consents – existing and new</i> .....	53
<i>Accommodated activities</i> .....	53
<i>Reclaimed land</i> .....	54
<i>Participation in recognition agreements or proceedings</i> .....	55
8. IMPLEMENTING PCR AND CMT – A HYPOTHETICAL CASE STUDY .....	56
9. IMPLICATIONS FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN FUTURE SETTLEMENT LEGISLATION .....	58
<i>The role of local government</i> .....	58
<i>The weight to be accorded iwi planning documents in other settlement legislation</i> .....	59
<i>Public participation under future settlement legislation</i> .....	61
10. CONCLUSION .....	62